

Dear Carlo

It has been a pleasure to discover your link. Me and my friends are delighted because we can find the right answers to our doubts about the Bridge Laws where we have a limited knowledge mainly about the 2017 version. My question:

W	N	E	S
-	1♣	p	1♣

West warns South that his bid is insufficient and immediately South says : “Sorry I did not see North bid” and he substitutes his 1♣ with 1♥. The TD is called and asks West whether he accepts the 1♥ call. West refuses to accept such bid and then the TD explains that since 1♥ is not a comparable call, North must pass every time it is his turn and in case NS should end up as defenders, Law 26, restricted leads, should also be applied.

I felt that the TD decision was a bit too severe. What would you say about it?

Best regards and congratulations for your splendid site  
Jo Trump

Answer

Dear Jo thanks for your kind comments. The TD has been almost perfect. The pertaining law is Law nr 27C. Players, unfortunately too often, instead of calling immediately the TD, substitute the illegal call. When the TD is called he has to propose the acceptance not of the substituting call but of the insufficient call. In our case West had the option of accepting the 1♣ call. If such call were not accepted, then 1♥ would remain as legal call and partner would have to pass every time it was his turn to bid because 1♥ is not comparable with 1♣. Moreover, since there is a withdrawn call, there will be lead restrictions if NS would become defenders and when Nord will have to lead the first time ( it could be the initial lead), declarer could forbid to lead ♣ or ♦ or ♠ having bid ♥ as natural. Law 72C, usually quite rarely, could also be applied: in fact I do not think that South could have rated that bidding 1♣ might have brought him some advantages. A part from the acceptance option, the TD decision is correct. A lack of attention followed by an impulsive substitution could lead to disaster. Players should be watchful and, in particular, stop immediately after the first infraction and call the TD.